

# **TOWN OF LAUDERDALE-BY-THE-SEA**

## **TOWN COMMISSION**

### **WORKSHOP MEETING MINUTES**

Town Commission Meeting Room

*4501 Ocean Drive*

*Tuesday, September 26, 2006*

*6:00 P.M.*

#### **1. CALL TO ORDER, MAYOR OLIVER PARKER**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Parker at 7:10 p.m. Present were Mayor Parker, Vice Mayor Yanni, Mayor Pro Tem Clark, Commissioner Silverstone and Commissioner McIntee. Also present were Municipal Services Director William Mason, Town Attorney James Cherof, and Town Clerk Medina.

#### **2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG**

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### **3. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

##### **A. Opening Statements**

Commissioner McIntee referenced copies of the Broward Sheriff's Office (BSO) PowerPoint presentation, stating it was unfair that the Volunteers had not received copies until this evening. Mayor Parker stated that the Commission could adjourn to provide the Volunteers with the opportunity to review the documentation. Commissioner McIntee felt that nothing contained in the packet from BSO's packet should be discussed. Mayor Parker felt that this was unfair, feeling that Commissioner McIntee was trying to "stack the deck" in favor of the Volunteer Fire Department. He emphasized the Commission's need to provide an "even-handed approach". Mayor Parker indicated that Commissioner McIntee needed to forget for the moment that he also served as Deputy Fire Chief but, if he felt the Volunteers were prejudiced for this workshop due to the additional information, the meeting could be recessed for the day to give the Volunteers the opportunity to review the material.

Commissioner McIntee asked Mayor Pro Tem Clark his feelings on the matter. Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that he wanted the workshops to be fair to both sides, with all information being laid out for proper review and discussion. He had no objections to tabling discussions until Friday, September 29, 2006.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked if the meeting could continue, with discussions being held later on any issues of concern. Commissioner McIntee stated that he was not concerned with any of the information; however, he stated that there were some accusations listed that "we" might not agree with and the Volunteers might wish to contest. Vice Mayor Yanni felt that the information provided was in response to the four questions on the agenda and did not believe a tabling was necessary. Commissioner Silverstone objected to the response times provided by BSO.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Vice Mayor Yanni made a motion, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Clark, to recess the meeting to Friday, September 29, 2006, at 6:00 p.m. In a roll call vote, all voted in favor. The motion carried 5-0.

Mayor Parker recessed the meeting at 6:18 p.m.

Mayor Parker reconvened the meeting on Friday, September 29, 2006, at 6:02 p.m.

Mayor Parker advised that personnel from the Sheriff's Office were wearing mourning bands over their badges as a police officer in Lakeland, Florida, had been shot. He asked for a moment of silence to honor the fallen officer.

Vice Mayor Yanni explained that the officer, together with his canine partner, had both been shot. He suggested that the flag at Town Hall be flown at half staff. There were no objections and the Mayor so ordered.

Battalion Chief Joseph Padden, representing the Volunteer Fire Department, was not present. The Commission had no objections to waiting for his arrival so that the Volunteers could begin their presentation.

Chief Padden stated that the Volunteers were here today to try to demonstrate to the Town that it was best suited to protect the people and property of the Town. He asked that residents consider the following issues: costs and the open and fair scrutiny of the Volunteers' recent actions and achievements.

Chief Padden stated that the Volunteers would never exaggerate or mislead the public with its facts and figures regarding their progress. He felt, however, that BSO would provide somewhat misleading claims and assertions regarding themselves and the Volunteers. Chief Padden stated that the Volunteers had, even though they were volunteers, put in a lot effort to become a qualified, competent, and motivated force with certification to back-up their abilities. He indicated that members of the Volunteer Fire Department spent time every week drilling and preparing for events they hoped would never happen. Chief Padden indicated that "sources" at the State level indicated that the Volunteers had exceeded the standards set for the State. And, added, that the Volunteers' liability insurance exceeded the normal standard. He indicated that the Volunteers were only trying to stop the apparent attempts of BSO to eliminate them by removing their responsibilities "one piece at a time". Chief Padden felt that if the Volunteers dissolved from atrophy, it would be impossible for them to "put the Genie back in the bottle".

Chief Joseph Lello, representing the Broward Sheriff's Office Department of Fire Rescue and Emergency Services, was present. He explained the mishap with the information provided on Tuesday, assuring the Commission that it had been provided in an effort to further explain data already provided. Chief Lello emphasized that there had

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

been no intent to mislead or deceive the Volunteers or the Commission. He was grateful for the opportunity to proceed with the workshops.

Chief Lello stated that there had been statements to the effect that this was a “David and Goliath” fight. He felt that “Goliath” was the inordinate amount of misinformation being promulgated. Chief Lello explained that there was a great divide between the departments, but felt that the goal should be finding a solution to bridge that divide. He explained that there had been problems on both sides, and to continue on this path would be destructive.

Chief Lello stated that he had no problems with volunteers, believing that volunteerism was the soul of America. He emphasized, however, that problems with the leadership of the Volunteers had to be resolved in order to ensure safety.

Chief Lanza asked that he be permitted to reserve his opening statements until the presentations were completed. There were no objections.

A brief discussion ensued, wherein the departments agreed that they would address all four questions at the same time. The Commission had no objections.

- B. Panel discussion regarding fire suppression services by Volunteer Fire Department, Broward Sheriff’s Office Department of Fire-Rescue and Emergency Services and Chief Chuck Lanza
1. What is your department’s role under the existing fire suppression contracts? Please explain what your department does, how you do it and what this brings to the Town in terms of fire protection and emergency medical response.
  2. Are you aware of any problems with the existing contracts, especially in terms of compliance and enforcement? If so, please elaborate.
  3. Do you feel the Town is getting its money’s worth out of the existing contracts, or are there more cost-efficient ways to provide the same level of fire suppression and emergency medical services?
  4. What suggestions would you make for improving the contracts if the Town were to continue to contract with the Broward Sheriff’s Office and the Volunteer Fire Department for fire protection and emergency medical services?

James Pollack, Chief Executive Assistant, provided a PowerPoint presentation and advised that based upon its contract with BSO, the Volunteers responded to all calls including fires, crashes, and other natural cause disasters, as well as providing assistance to all medical calls. He indicated that in direct violation of the contract, there had been a reduction in calls to the Volunteers through the sole mandate of BSO. Mr. Pollack explained that calls were accomplished by ensuring an officer was on call 24

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

hours a day, 7 days a week, along with well-trained, qualified members responding in adequate time.

Mr. Pollack stated that improvements showed that the Volunteers were getting stronger every day, enabling them to provide a well-trained and cost effective fire service with first responder capabilities. He provided a brief description of the training offered, stating that although it was not mandatory, attendance at every session was encouraged.

Mr. Pollack referenced an e-mail he received from Walton Malloy, Safety Program Manager of the Division of Fire Marshal, in March 2004. He indicated that Mr. Malloy had indicated that the Volunteers' policies were quite advanced for a volunteer group. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers built the matrix based upon the standards for volunteers within the State. He felt that the Volunteers had continued to get "stronger and tighter".

Mr. Pollack stated that call reduction, communication, training, and the budget process had all been listed as problems. He indicated that call reduction had been mandated in direct violation of the contract, briefly addressing different areas of the contract he felt were not being followed. Mr. Pollack stated that modifications to the agreement could only be made upon the mutual written consent of both parties.

Mr. Pollack stated that the idea of a Volunteer Fire Department was different than that of a career company, stating that they did not reside and train for three hours a day. Volunteers, instead, discussed how to better respond after the call was done. He felt that every time the Volunteers missed a call, they lost the opportunity to become better. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers averaged 14 individuals per call, a high level of service to be provided to the Town.

Mr. Pollack stated that there were times during a call to a highrise building, that contact with command could not be had. He indicated that the Volunteers used a back-up system using the Town's radios for communications.

Mr. Pollack stated that based upon the contract, BSO representatives were to schedule joint training with the Volunteers. He indicated that instead, the Volunteers had only received 12 letters explaining mistakes the Volunteers had made. Mr. Pollack stated that in that respect, BSO had never taken the opportunity to attend the drills practiced by the Volunteers or taken advantage of joint training to work out the kinks and build a level of trust between the two units. He explained that the Volunteers had, therefore, created its own training program. Mr. Pollack felt that their training made them capable of providing the proper service to the Town.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers' budget had never been truly reviewed by both parties, with the Volunteers only being allowed to increase five percent of funds to all

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

capital items. He indicated that line item budgets were not provided, but indicated that this was not a hindrance as the Volunteers would ensure proper service with the funds approved.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers felt that the "Town was overburdened with excess fire protection" and the cause for this was the improvements made by the Volunteer Fire Department, as directed by the resolution adopted by the Commission. He indicated that fire-rescue was also providing an overprotection that could be alleviated by providing mobile emergency medical services by an independent ambulance service, such as American Medical Response. Mr. Pollack felt that the Commission could save approximately \$1.9 million yearly by using the Volunteers and a private ambulance service. He indicated that with the training, track record, and ability of its membership, the Volunteers had worked hard to communicate on fire scenes.

Mr. Pollack stated that BSO had expressed concern with a lack of communication with the officers from the Volunteers, noting that BSO did not understand that the first four to five certified individuals "getting on the truck" were responding as neighbors going out to help neighbors. He explained that many hats were worn within the Volunteers' organization.

Mr. Pollack stated that upon arriving at a scene, Volunteers had to request orders or they would sit dormant. He indicated that in the last ten calls, the Volunteers had been called off of seven calls. Mr. Pollack stated that in reviewing those calls, the Volunteers had found problems with BSO's response and emphasized that "we don't want to be the ones painting Xs on people's foreheads".

Mr. Pollack stated that it was the Volunteers' belief that they had earned the trust of the Commission and residents of the Town.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers did not address the Commission's fourth question, believing that it should be the sole provider for the Town. He indicated that the Volunteers would continue to operate in the most professional manner under any contract. Mr. Pollack believed that under the resolution adopted by the Town, the Volunteers were proceeding as requested by the Commission. He stated that the Town only needed to request what it wanted delivered, and the Volunteers would deliver.

Mayor Parker asked if there was any response at this time to the allegations made by the Broward Sheriff's Office. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers were prepared to show the Commission its training certification matrix, explanation of benefits, incentives, and administrative payouts by positions, residence locations, line item expenses of the budget, current BSO approved budget for 2005-06, and the Volunteers' \$500,000 proposed budget. Mayor Parker felt that these items were perhaps better discussed after BSO made its presentation. Commissioner McIntee felt that Mr. Pollack was doing a great job and should be allowed to continue uninterrupted.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Mr. Pollack reviewed the Command and Administrative Roster which denoted each member, their certification, and their positions within the department. He briefly described what training had been obtained and who was receiving in-house training. Mr. Pollack described the earnings by each member and indicated that five percent was paid by each member to cover the costs of the pension fund, the annual holiday party, the meals for the monthly meetings, and upkeep and fuel for the auxiliary truck and other miscellaneous items. He then explained the payout for the final compensation of the pension trust fund.

Mr. Pollack then detailed the yearly pay for Volunteer members by position, which included \$20,775 for the fire chief; \$6,710 for the deputy fire chief; \$4,225 for the battalion chief; \$6,275 for the captain; \$1,125 for another captain; \$9,955 for a lieutenant; \$4,415 for another lieutenant; \$10,550 for the treasurer/secretary; \$1,280 for an associate lieutenant; \$1,925 for water rescue instructor; \$2,115 for the safety officer; \$8,840 for the assistant safety officer; \$11,675 for the communications officers; \$5,110 for the president; \$4,095 for the vice president; and \$20,375 for the chief executive assistant. He explained that the compensation paid throughout the year included administrative fees and the incentive pay for responding to emergency calls and drills. Mr. Pollack explained that due to the transition, the fire chief had also made \$8,120 for administrative duties within the first part of the year and, within the course of the remainder of the year, earned another \$7,370 for fire calls.

Commissioner McIntee stated that there were only two or three Volunteer firefighters who received more than \$2,500.

Mayor Parker asked what "immediate response zone" identified. Mr. Pollack stated that those were the members that did not live within the Town's boundaries. He indicated that usually those members lived just across the bridge or within two miles of the Town. Mr. Pollack explained that associate members only responded to emergency calls or attended drills while on station watch. He indicated that the total payroll for the year had been \$236,275.

Mr. Pollack stated that the average incentive compensation for in-town firefighters received \$3,888; while firefighters within the immediate response zone, averaged an incentive pay of \$2,824.05. He indicated that associate members averaged \$297.56 for completing their station watch.

Mr. Pollack referenced the line item expenses and explained the process in which they were reported. He expressed his belief that the Volunteers were well under budget for the year by \$25,000 to \$30,000. Mr. Pollack referenced the budget provided by BSO, reiterating that it had only been a five percent increase from the previous year. He explained that BSO's budget was distributed for personnel costs, operating costs, and capital costs as defined in the contract.

Commissioner McIntee asked if there were any funds which were not noted within the

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

documentation provided by the Volunteers. Mr. Pollack replied negatively. Commissioner Silverstone explained that there were other funds, such as the booster funds that were not shown.

Vice Mayor Yanni noted that it was obvious that Commissioners McIntee and Silverstone, as fire chief and deputy fire chief, were well acquainted with the budget being presented. He felt it was unfair for them to lead the questioning of the Volunteers' departmental presentation. Mayor Parker asked who had prepared the presentation. Mr. Pollack stated that he met with the Board of Directors, as well as the chiefs, in the preparation of the budget and the presentation. He explained that the budget was also presented to "the whole floor" for approval, which included the entire department. Chief Padden stated that the Volunteers had been provided with their budget by BSO and had not really been given an opportunity to make changes to the budget itself. Mayor Parker questioned if the budget for the upcoming year had been adopted. Mr. Pollack replied affirmatively, explaining again that BSO only designated an additional five percent increase.

Deputy Fire Chief Paul LeDuc, representing BSO, stated that the Volunteers submitted a request for the upcoming year in the amount of \$597,692.60. He explained that BSO did place a five percent cap on its budget preparations from year to year. Mayor Parker asked who had prepared the proposed budget submitted to BSO. Mr. Pollack explained that he put together all the data, with input from different members. He stated that the budget was presented to the Board of Directors and the department as a whole.

Mr. Pollack continued to explain benefits available to the membership, which included disability insurance equating to \$37,000 yearly. He concluded the presentation by stating that the proposed budget also included a three percent contingency for incentive payments, with a two percent contingency on the overall budget, stating that fire calls were "as difficult to predict as the weather".

Commissioner McIntee asked Mayor Parker if all the questions had been addressed by the Volunteer Fire Department. Mayor Parker replied negatively, stating that Mr. Pollack had specifically indicated that the fourth question would not be considered.

Mayor Parker called a recess at 7:22 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 7:31 p.m.

Chief LeDuc provided a PowerPoint presentation, explaining the services offered by the Broward Sheriff's Office Department of Fire Rescue and Emergency Services. He indicated that these services included two paramedic trained units: Rescue 12 and Engine 36, a paramedic staffed and equipped fire engine company within the Town. Chief LeDuc stated that since the majority of the calls within the Town were medically related, the Town had a level of emergency medical services that was exceptional.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Chief LeDuc provided a brief history of the services provided by the Broward Sheriff's Office in general, which included law enforcement, fire-rescue, homeland security, a complete 9-1-1 communication, and a complete comprehensive public safety approach to providing its services. He stated that on the fire side, public safety was accomplished by highly trained and competent employees emphasizing the training requirements at time of hire and the continued training required upon being hired. Chief LeDuc emphasized that the cross training received allowed personnel to not only provide fire suppression, but to switch roles and provide immediate advanced life support as necessary. He explained that this type of training not only benefited the residents of the Town, but ensured the safety of life and property. Chief LeDuc stated that training was essential to the department and the high standards set the agency apart from most others.

Chief LeDuc stated that BSO mandated continued training to ensure that its personnel could face the changing challenges forced upon them, including hazardous materials and tactical teams, weapons of mass destruction, water rescue, and other vast comprehensive training which included 520 hours of additional training before being allowed to serve on an apparatus. This training, of course, ensured that the personnel were well equipped and prepared to handle all the facets of dangers they might encounter in the community.

Chief LeDuc stated that a unified system for public safety was the primary goal of BSO. He indicated that firefighters had the responsibility, plus accountability, to ensure that training was pursued, with a minimum of three hours of training each shift. Chief LeDuc stated that as difficult as it was for a career firefighter to meet the training demands – volunteers found it even more difficult to meet the required training demands because of outside responsibilities.

Chief LeDuc stated that the Volunteer Fire Department required their membership to obtain 160 hours of training within one year, which was the minimum standard set for the State. He indicated that Volunteers were also required to attend eight training events within a six month period. Chief LeDuc explained that volunteers were required to respond to 20 percent of calls, but advised that in reviewing the roster, approximately one third of the Volunteer roster did not appear or respond to calls. He further explained that approximately 12 members were the ones that responded to 50 percent or greater of the calls. Chief LeDuc stated that the problems created by the demands to respond to calls was a challenge suffered by volunteers nationwide.

Chief LeDuc advised that the standards set for firefighters was a total of 303 hours of training yearly, whereby BSO provided 530 hours of training yearly. He detailed other types of specific training and certification, such as infectious disease and occupational exposures. Chief LeDuc felt that training was essential to ensure the safety of personnel so that they were able to and capable of protecting the community.

Chief LeDuc referenced comments made regarding the contract held between the

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Broward Sheriff's Office and the Volunteer Fire Department, emphasizing that the contract specifically indicated that the Volunteers had to follow the standard operating procedures set by BSO. He indicated that the contract further stated that the Volunteers' standard operating procedures could not be in conflict with BSO. Chief LeDuc emphasized that all calls were potentially hazardous to personnel and, therefore, dispatching and responding with an appropriate number of apparatus was essential. He felt that it was irresponsible, from a public safety standpoint, to do otherwise. Chief LeDuc explained that Volunteers had claimed that not responding eliminated their ability to properly train; however, he felt it was imperative that training not be obtained during calls. Again, he reiterated that training was essential prior to responding to ensure the safety of personnel and the community at large.

At Mayor Parker's request, Chief LeDuc explained the industry standards for firefighters and the ISO rating which took into account the training obtained.

At Commissioner McIntee's request, Chief LeDuc explained the sequence in calls, specifically "Code One". Commissioner McIntee felt that each time an elevator call was placed, BSO took a paramedic unit out of service to respond instead of sending the Volunteers. He felt that it was unreasonable for BSO not to allow the Volunteers to respond so that they could "learn how to do it". Chief LeDuc explained that although it was typically not a medical emergency, a person trapped in an elevator may require medical assistance depending on their reaction to being trapped. He further explained that once the situation was mitigated, the unit could be returned to service immediately. Chief LeDuc advised that a second paramedic trained unit was available and, therefore, the Town was not left unprotected at any time. He emphasized that the time for training was not during an emergency call. Chief LeDuc stated that BSO provided the fiscal support for Volunteers to obtain the proper training.

Mayor Parker asked if Engine 36 was primarily a medical response unit as opposed to a fire suppression unit. Chief LeDuc replied negatively, but explained that it had the advantage of being able to serve as both as it was staffed with highly trained, State certified paramedics, carrying the same equipment and medical supplies as that of a rescue squad. He provided examples of the types of services this equipment and its personnel could provide. Mayor Parker asked for confirmation that although Engine 36 was primarily a fire suppression vehicle that had advanced life support capabilities as victims of fires typically needed medical support at the same time. Chief LeDuc confirmed the explanation. Chief Lello emphasized that the priority at any fire scenario was the preservation of life. He provided a description of the types of rescues that could be performed under different circumstances.

Commissioner McIntee asked to be provided with a total number of calls run by Engine 36, listing how many were medical and how many were in response to calls from Sea Ranch Lakes.

Chief LeDuc described the experience of the leadership within BSO, as well as the rank

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

and file within the department. He explained the duties and experience of the individual personnel and the supervisory levels followed within the department. Chief LeDuc advised that the leadership within the department was on call 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. He added that personnel were trained and well versed in the incident command system as mandated by the Federal Emergency Management Agency to ensure the safety of personnel and the community.

Chief LeDuc referenced analysis chart regarding response times, explaining the differences in the times shown from the time a 9-1-1 call was placed and the time a unit arrived on the scene. He explained that BSO units arrived on average within 4 minutes 48 seconds, while vehicles equipped by the Volunteers arrived within 7 minutes 20 seconds and 10 minutes 6 seconds. Chief LeDuc advised that although there were times when the Volunteers arrived sooner, by and large, BSO provided a much better response time. Commissioner Silverstone felt that the response times were unfair as the Volunteers only provided fire suppression services and not medical services. He indicated, too, that the Chief's response times to calls were not being provided.

Commissioner McIntee asked that Mr. Pollack confirm the response times and that he provide response times for Chief 12. Mr. Pollack advised that Chief 12's response was 4 minutes and 19 seconds, but explained that this time was calculated from the time the pagers were set off with the call as opposed to when the 9-1-1 call was received.

Mayor Parker asked for a listing of all calls received and when, together with the response time for each vehicle from time of call to time of arrival at the scene. Commissioner Silverstone questioned if the Volunteers were notified at the same time as BSO personnel. Chief LeDuc replied affirmatively. Mayor Parker asked that this information be provided at the next workshop, requesting that the information be provided well in advance of the meeting so that it could be properly reviewed by the Commission. There were no objections.

Chief LeDuc addressed the problems with the administration and compliance of the contract between BSO and the Volunteers, particularly with the leadership for the Volunteers. He emphasized BSO's respect of the Volunteers and the work they performed, but stated that the continuing concerns for safety issues that were being ignored, disregarded or just not being followed. Chief LeDuc stated that safety concerns had to be addressed as they had the potential for endangering the personnel as well as the community. He indicated that one of the main issues to address was the lack of use of the incident command system that was repeatedly violated by Volunteer personnel. Chief LeDuc explained that violations of the incident command system was a formula for disaster which could equate to someone getting hurt or killed.

Chief LeDuc stated that since Volunteer personnel sometimes served in different capacities within a scene, it inherently confused roles within the strategy planning and execution of the response. He explained that although the Volunteers had been offended by the reporting of unsafe procedures within the last two years, the Volunteers

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

were not treated any differently than the manner in which they would address any safety issues within their own department. Chief LeDuc stated that although the Volunteers were now claiming unsafe procedures on behalf of BSO, no reports of these incidents had ever been reported until now. He emphasized that a safety concern reported on yesterday's date had been reviewed and investigated and determined to be unfounded. Chief LeDuc stated that disregard of safety practices on scene ranged from hazardous materials to lack of proper equipment and gear. He explained that the Volunteer Fire Department was BSO's sub-contractor and that disregard for safety rules caused concern for BSO personnel safety, as well as that of the Volunteers' personnel. Chief LeDuc explained that safety violations were flagrant and repeated time and time again. He felt that it was a legitimate concern that needed to be addressed immediately.

Commissioner McIntee stated that during the time Battalion Chief Don King was assigned to the Town, only two complaints had been filed against the Volunteers. Chief LeDuc believed that there had been many more complaints, all similar in nature to the problems still being experienced today. He indicated that one of the complaints that came to mind immediately was that of a chief officer responding to a highrise floor where a fire had been reported with no protective gear.

Mayor Parker expressed concern that it appeared that Commissioner McIntee was testifying on behalf of the Volunteer Fire Department as opposed to reviewing the information as a Commissioner.

Commissioner McIntee asked how many letters the Volunteers had received in the approximate three months that the new Battalion Chief had been assigned to Town. Chief Lello stated that upon his taking command of the BSO Fire Department as Acting Chief, on March 1, 2006, he had reviewed the contract file and found it unacceptable to note the violations of incident command and national incident management systems. He stated that it had been his decision to remove Chief King from his position in Lauderdale-By-The-Sea to ensure the safety of his personnel as well as that of his sub-contractors. Chief Lello stated that he had replaced Chief King with Chief John Frailey, a highly decorated, talented, and educated fire officer. He explained that due to his concerns for the repeated violations, he would not continue to allow similar practices. Commissioner McIntee agreed with the action taken, indicating that there had been 17 letters received by the Volunteers.

Mayor Parker again expressed concern that Commissioner McIntee appeared to be testifying on behalf of the Volunteer Fire Department. He indicated that if Commissioner McIntee wished to testify as deputy fire chief, perhaps he should take leave from the dais so that he could continue to do so.

Commissioner Silverstone wished to respond to the violation being noted. Mayor Parker stated that he had no objections to either Commissioner McIntee or Commissioner Silverstone taking their his place with the Volunteer Fire Department under their current status as Fire Chief. He felt, however, that the information being

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

presented needed to be reviewed by the Commission who was suppose to be representing the interests of the Town. Commissioner Silverstone felt that the Town should consider itself lucky to have people sitting on the dais that were knowledgeable on both sides of the facts in this matter.

Chief LeDuc stated that lessons learned throughout the years of fire service was what maintained the safety of current responders. He emphasized the dangers of using multiple radios on a fire scene, stating that the Volunteers continued to keep their own radio system to which BSO had no access. Chief LeDuc stated that orders continued to be issued to personnel over that system without going through the incident commander, creating a dangerous situation for all responders on the scene. He explained that the majority of time, disregard for this safety procedure was noted on non-highrise scenario. Chief LeDuc stated that repeated notifications had gone unaddressed. He explained, too, that communications held on the personal radio system could not be monitored by the dispatch center. Chief LeDuc emphasized the danger in continuing this practice.

Commissioner Silverstone stated that there were times when safety violations occurred by BSO personnel, yet no one appeared to follow up on those matters. Chief LeDuc advised that if there had been any safety concerns, it was expected that those concerns be reported to BSO. He stated that the intent of reporting safety concerns was not a matter of demeaning anyone, but to discuss and ensure public safety within the community. Chief LeDuc advised that since these issues had not yet been addressed by the leadership for the Volunteers, it was necessary to bring these items to the Commission in an attempt to resolve them.

Commissioner McIntee asked if any BSO fire officers used their cell phones at a fire scene, stating that those could be considered radios as well. Chief LeDuc replied that he probably has seen cell phones used on fire scenes, but assured the Commission that orders were not issued by cell phone on the fire ground. Commissioner McIntee did not believe that to be the case.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that all issues of concern had to be heard and indicated that if the issues mentioned offended anyone, "that was too bad". He felt the Commission had a responsibility to hear all the information being provided. Mayor Pro Tem Clark asked if, by two radios, Chief LeDuc was indicating that two different nets were being used. Chief LeDuc replied affirmatively, stating that the two systems could not hear or talk to one another.

Chief LeDuc stated that it was apparent that the Volunteers took offense to receiving letters of notification regarding safety issues. He explained that safety was taken very seriously within the department and, ultimately, as a sub-contractor the Volunteers were their responsibility. Chief LeDuc stated that he brought these complaints forth to the Commission heavy-heartedly, but openly and honestly for the Commission's decision

making.

Chief LeDuc stated that there were continued and repeated concerns with the leadership for the Volunteers who entered hazardous environments without protective gear. He indicated that these safety concerns further complicated a delicate scene by having the possibility of having to affect a rescue for a firefighter, including no protective gear at a highrise where a fire was reported; entering the area of a gas leak without bunker gear; entering a building reported to be filled with gas in shorts and a t-shirt; and entering an explosive environment wearing shorts, t-shirt and deck shoes.

Commissioner McIntee asked if BSO officers should be responding to a gas leak in full turn-out gear. Chief LeDuc replied affirmatively. Commissioner McIntee asked Chief LeDuc if he would be upset to learn that there were photographs of one of his officers responding without protective gear. Chief LeDuc replied affirmatively, but added that it would upset him just as much if this knowledge had not been shared with him until this point. He stated that no fire department was perfect, nor any rescue completely error free; however, he emphasized that the repeated flagrant disregard for safety issues by the leadership of the Volunteers was a continued problem. Chief LeDuc emphasized that he had no problems disciplining his own crews for safety violations.

Chief LeDuc stated that freelancing on fire scenes was also a repeated concern, including the advancement of hose lines without orders, laying supply lines without orders, taking action (such as going on a roof) without reporting to the incident commander, or incidents where orders were just not understood. He provided photographs for the Commission's reviewing, depicting Volunteers performing dangerous tasks without protective gear. Commissioner McIntee asked if this was the best BSO could come up with, indicating that the Volunteers always provided assistance to the general public. Mayor Parker again indicated that Commissioner McIntee was testifying on behalf of the Volunteers. He questioned if the photograph depicting the cutting of coconuts could be identified as to the location. Chief LeDuc stated that this activity had occurred at a member's residence. Mayor Parker asked if this had been a paid exercise. Chief LeDuc replied that it was his understanding that it had indeed been a paid exercise. He explained, however, that BSO's concern was not with the activity, the fact of whether it was a paid exercise, but the actual lack of safety being shown. Commissioner McIntee felt that this complaint was "Mickey Mouse" and felt that it was not a concern at all.

Chief Lello stated that his concerns were not with the Volunteers as the Volunteers were only as good as its leadership. He stated that there were leadership issues which led to unsafe practices that violated fire ground safety practices. Chief Lello stated that in every text book read and every operation he had been involved in within the last four decades, the leadership was violating every safety practice standard. He emphasized that this was in no way acceptable and, although it did not mean that he was unwilling to work with the department, unsafe practices had to cease immediately. Chief Lello stressed the grave concern he had for the community with the disregard for safety held

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

by the Volunteer leadership. He indicated that how the Commission wished to deal with this matter was its concern, but felt he could not have his crews and the community placed in danger because of this disregard.

Chief Lello questioned if these issues could be resolved. He wanted to find an amicable resolution, but felt that it was up to the leadership to determine if a true resolution could be had. Vice Mayor Yanni agreed that this was an important issue of concern. He questioned if as Fire Chief, Chief Lello had the ability to order the Volunteer Fire Department and its membership. Chief Lello explained that it was his understanding that orders had been issued and orders had not been followed. Vice Mayor Yanni asked if orders were not followed, was BSO able to request disciplinary action. Chief Lello responded that discipline was not direct, but stated that discipline had been requested in the past to no avail. Chief LeDuc stated that discipline had been requested several times throughout the past two years, but no accountability had been forthcoming. He indicated that the chief and deputy chief of the department were ultimately responsible for the command of the department and for the investigation of any allegations. Chief LeDuc reiterated that it was with a heavy heart that these issues were brought to the attention of the Commission, but the level of frustration regarding the continued disregard for safety issues was surmountable.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked Mr. Pollack if any discipline had been provided to the membership. Mr. Pollack replied affirmatively, stating that reprimands and suspensions had been effectuated. Vice Mayor Yanni asked if members had been disciplined for any of the issues noted today. Chief Padden stated that in terms of not following procedures, the individual members were "talked to" and provided with instruction.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked why BSO permitted the use of two radios, feeling that this was a truly dangerous situation. Chief Lello agreed, but indicated that numerous requests in the past two years had gone unaddressed. He indicated that the reason cited was the concern for using BSO radios in highrises, but stressed the continued disregard for the regulations occurred on all fire ground scenes.

Mayor Parker asked if there was any other information requested of the Volunteers that had not been provided. Chief Lello replied affirmatively, stating that records for training and personnel information had yet to be provided.

Commissioner McIntee referenced the types of radios used throughout the years and described the difference in technology of VHF, UHF, and 800 megahertz types. Chief Lello explained that all types of radios experienced different problems in highrise situations.

Chief LeDuc stated that unfortunately, the relationship was not working properly and BSO was looking into all available options. He indicated that BSO had no objections to volunteers in general or the concept of volunteerism and, to that effect, provided a Reserve Fire Unit to allow for that same type of service within the department.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Chief LeDuc stated that BSO provided the Town with a full service, combined public safety agency that provided a highly trained and competent service, second to none, that ensured the safety and welfare of its residents and visitors. He felt that the Town was receiving its money's worth for the services it received, but expressed concern with the performance of the contract between BSO and the Volunteers.

Commissioner McIntee asked for the total calls received in Town. Chief LeDuc stated that during 2005, there had been a total of 1,341 runs, with 794 being medical calls. He stated that Sea Ranch Lakes had had an independent total of 63 runs, with 30 being medicals calls.

Commissioner McIntee asked that BSO provide, at the next meeting, the reason why Sea Ranch Lakes paid \$50,000 for their fire and medical services as opposed to the Town's \$3 million. Mayor Parker asked that the total calls be listed with an indication of what apparatus responded.

Mayor Parker called a recess at 9:05 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 9:17 p.m.

Mayor Parker advised that he had spoken with the representatives for both departments and, in light of the hour, both had agreed to do their rebuttals at the next workshop meeting. He indicated that both departments had also agreed to speak with Chief Chuck Lanza, the town's representative, prior to the next workshop meeting. Mayor Parker stated that Chief Lanza had requested, with the agreement of both departments, to withhold from commenting until he spoke with both departments in an effort to allow the departments to work out their difficulties.

Commissioner McIntee could not believe that the Volunteers had agreed to this arrangement. Chief Padden explained that this would provide the Volunteers with sufficient time to address the allegations presented at tonight's meeting.

- C. Provide confirmation of number of fire suppression and emergency service calls within the Town in the past year

This item was discussed earlier in the meeting.

After a brief discussion, the Commission agreed that this meeting should be recessed to October 25, 2006.

It was agreed that both departments would provide the Town Clerk with the requested information by October 17<sup>th</sup>. Mayor Parker asked that Chief Lanza also be provided

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

with all the information prior to the next meeting. It was further agreed that the information to be provided by October 17<sup>th</sup> would not be reviewed at the continuation of the next workshop, but instead at a subsequent workshop meeting.

Vice Mayor Yanni made a motion, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Clark, to recess the meeting to October 25, 2006, at 6:00 p.m. As there were no objections, Mayor Parker recessed the meeting.

Mayor Parker reconvened the meeting on October 25, 2006, at 6:05 p.m.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chief Padden advised that although the information regarding salaries had been provided by BSO, they had not included the information as part of their original presentation. Chief LeDuc briefly detailed the salary breakdown.

Chief Padden requested permission to address the Commission first so that the allegations presented by BSO could be rebutted. Chief LeDuc had no objections, stating that BSO would only be formally addressing specific points and advised no PowerPoint presentation would be made.

Mr. Pollack stated that in response to Mayor Pro Tem Clark's questions from a few meetings ago, a PowerPoint presentation had been created. Mr. Padden felt that BSO continued to address "false, minor trumped up issues" that have already been addressed or would be addressed during this meeting. He thought the Commission needed to question whether 100 percent of all BSO firefighters were paramedic certified and were all paramedics firefighter II certified. Chief Padden referenced the shift work used by BSO and questioned the validity of the training hours that Chief LeDuc claimed was followed by his personnel. He expressed his belief that the individuals placed on Engine 36 and the salary of Chief Frailey well exceeded \$1 million. Chief Padden questioned who was paying for the extra personnel.

Chief Lanza explained that the Town signed a contract with BSO to provide five people within the Town, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, to include Engine 36, Rescue 12, an advanced life support engine and rescue, as well as any other automatic aid that was necessary, for a specified dollar amount. He further explained that if the Sheriff opted to place additional people within the Town's boundaries, it was the Sheriff's concern and not the Town's concern. Commissioner McIntee felt that Chief Lanza was taking time away from the Volunteers and asked him to reserve his comments at this time. Chief Padden stated that he had no problems with the way career firefighter shifts were structured, only the cost involved with the additional individuals sent to serve within the Town.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers believed that they were well capable and competent to be the sole fire suppression provider within the Town. He indicated that

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

all the concerns expressed by BSO could be resolved if joint training took place. Mr. Pollack felt that if these issues were of true concern, why had the concerns not been voiced prior to a public meeting where they were used as attacks on the Volunteers. He stated that if Volunteers did not take action on a fire ground, they were not acknowledged upon responding.

Mr. Pollack stated that with regards to incident command, Volunteers had to get the best crew out as soon as possible. He indicated that the personnel who were first to respond at the station took up the necessary roles to ensure they could respond quickly. Mr. Pollack advised that Volunteers had agreed not to use the Town radios on a fire ground unless it was an absolute emergency. He indicated that Town radios were only used to communicate between Volunteer personnel. Mr. Pollack added that the use of Town radios allowed the Volunteers to discontinue use of the Town-wide alerting siren. He added, for information, that most departments allowed the use of a back-up radio in case the trunk system failed. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers were providing the same service it had provided for the last 40 years. He indicated that the Volunteers prided themselves in representing "neighbors helping neighbors", assisting seniors and other residents.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers were doing a great job and prepared each of its presentations based on the improvements and merits of the Volunteers' abilities, as well as cost effectiveness.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers were limited to a five percent increase each year.

Mayor Parker asked Commissioners McIntee and Silverstone if they had assisted with the preparation of the current PowerPoint presentation. Commissioner Silverstone replied affirmatively. Commissioner McIntee stated that he did not recall if he had participated. Mr. Pollack advised that this was a volunteer organization and that he had worked with the entire membership to complete the presentation.

Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers had raised in excess of \$305,000 to remodel and rebuild the fire station. He briefly described the ranks and the amounts earned by each Volunteer member. Mr. Pollack also explained the differences in earnings by identifying administrative pay, incentive pay, and training pay. He also described the different duties for some of the members.

At the request of Mayor Parker, Chief Padden provided the history of service for some members. He explained that all positions were elected, except for those where the fire chief made an appointment. Mayor Parker asked what the qualifications were for the Volunteer Fire Chief. Chief Padden replied that the fire chief had to be a certified firefighter I. At Vice Mayor Gianni's request, Chief LeDuc provided the extensive

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

experience and years of service required for different types of positions within the BSO rank and file. Chief Padden acknowledged that the degree of experience was different within a volunteer department as opposed to a career department.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked if the "EMT" training referred to by the Volunteers was in any way comparable to the expertise of a paramedic. He felt that allowing people to believe that EMT trained personnel was sufficient to provide the needed services, provided a false sense of security that Volunteers could act as first responders and assist with a person having a heart attack. Chief Padden stated that the Volunteers' presentation was in no way meant to address whether the Volunteers were qualified to attend medical calls. He explained that it was only referenced because BSO personnel were cross-trained. Vice Mayor Yanni stated that claiming to have certified EMTs working with the Volunteers gave people the impression that the Volunteers could respond to medical calls. Chief Padden stated that they could respond to medical calls to obtain statistics, stabilize a patient, and provide oxygen, if necessary. He indicated that the Volunteers were not programmed to provide medical services.

Vice Mayor Yanni stated that emergency medical services were an important part of public safety and felt that it needed to be addressed. Chief Padden emphasized that the Volunteers were not looking to replace fire-rescue services and believed BSO to be one of the best providers within Broward County. He stated that if the Volunteers were not allowed to become the sole provider, they would fall apart from "atrophy". Chief Padden expressed his belief that this was BSO's ultimate goal. He indicated that he could not rate whether the Volunteers were better qualified than BSO, but felt that it could not be discounted that the Volunteers could respond with approximately 14 individuals, not to mention that they were cheaper. Chief Padden felt that the Volunteers had proven that they could do the job.

Vice Mayor Yanni stated that the Volunteers had, on several occasions, stated that they would pursue being the same type of department as that of the Plantation Volunteer Fire Department. He asked if the Volunteers would agree to take less incentive pay. Chief Padden stated that the Plantation Volunteer Fire Department was a spectacular department and believed that the Volunteers were at least as qualified as they were. He indicated that he was unsure what the membership would agree to as far as incentive pay was concerned.

Commissioner McIntee stated that during the last meeting Chief LeDuc had indicated that the Volunteers had proposed a budget of \$597,000 and asked for confirmation of whether this was true. Chief Padden stated that the reason for submitting the proposed budget was that it had included \$100,000 for transition activities so that the Volunteers could take over Town-wide suppression. He indicated that the Volunteers had been advised that they would be limited to a five percent increase. Chief LeDuc confirmed that the request was made by the Volunteers for \$596,000 this year to operate as a subcontractor to BSO. He further confirmed that this request had been denied.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Commissioner Silverstone asked if Chief Lanza had reviewed the proposed numbers. Chief Lanza replied affirmatively, stating that if the Volunteers provided no additional services and remained performing only as it was now, those numbers could be correct. Commissioner McIntee felt that paramedic services was not for this discussion and should not be addressed at this time. Chief Lanza emphasized that the Volunteers budget was adequate for the purposes of providing only those services currently being provided by the Volunteers. He stated, however, that despite not using the emergency medical services, it did not compare with the level of service the Town currently enjoyed.

Mayor Parker expressed concern that Commissioners McIntee and Silverstone appeared to have had some preview of the presentation when the other three Commissioners had not had the same luxury. Chief Padden stated that Mr. Pollack had prepared the presentation with input from all members. Commissioner McIntee stated that he was not interested in the budget itself and only questioned specific numbers and costs. Commissioner Silverstone stated that his preview of the presentation had been what he had reviewed in *By The Sea Times*.

Mayor Parker asked what the extra funds requested would be used for. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers would use the funds to purchase a new engine. Mayor Parker questioned why the department would not invest in a ladder truck. This issue was not further discussed.

Mr. Pollack stated that since fires were difficult to predict, there were approximately \$23,000 in contingency to ensure sufficient funds for incentive pay.

Commissioner McIntee asked for confirmation that the two fire trucks currently used by BSO would be returned to the Volunteers upon termination of the contract. He questioned, too, what the current odometer reading was for those vehicles. Mr. Pollack replied affirmatively and indicated that the odometer readings were at approximately 11,000. Mayor Parker stated that if the current trucks pumped water, he could not understand why the Volunteers would not obtain a replacement truck that also pumped water. Mr. Pollack stated that the vehicles that had been researched also had the capability of pumping water. He further explained that the costs were based on a leasing, per year basis.

Mr. Pollack stated the Volunteers had been advised that the fire station would need to be paid for within 10 years, with additional time being possible if a bond issue was obtained. Manager Baldwin explained that the funds would need to be borrowed and repayment of the loan would be based on the type of loan obtained.

Mr. Pollack stated that it was difficult to determine what type of capital purchases would

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

be needed, but estimated the costs based on past spending.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that he had reviewed and compared the past three budgets prepared and/or proposed by the Volunteers. He questioned why there were no funds allocated to fire prevention. Mr. Pollack stated that no funds had been allocated as he believed that the funds received for fire inspections would offset the cost of running such a program. Mayor Pro Tem Clark disagreed, stating that he had reviewed the fee schedule adopted by Broward County and felt that it would be insufficient to offset the costs.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that there were no funds allocated for start-up fees, such as the cost for inspectors, group insurance, pension costs, radios, and other miscellaneous equipment that would be necessary. He felt that it would be prudent for the Volunteers to make an accurate assumption of the start-up costs. Commissioner Silverstone explained that there were currently three members that would soon be certified as inspectors.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that there was \$17,000 allocated to the pension in 2005; however, the proposed budget lowered pension costs to \$11,747. He asked how this reduction was justified. Mr. Pollack stated that the number of calls and drills had been adjusted to lower levels. He indicated that he had prepared several draft budgets since 2005 and, not knowing exactly which budget was being referenced, he could not accurately respond to the question. Mr. Pollack reiterated, however, that the figures provided at this time were accurate.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that no funds had been allocated to the station watch program. Mr. Pollack stated that station watch personnel spent approximately six to eight hours a day at the station and, since there was a large volume of response, it had been determined that no cost needed to be included. Mayor Pro Tem Clark indicated that the previous budget provided for approximately \$29,200. Mr. Pollack explained that since daily incentive drills did not have to be provided, the cost of the station watch program had been reduced.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark expressed concern that training costs were reduced from \$97,800 to \$37,860. Mr. Pollack explained that while developing the program to provide the department with depth, incentive pay was provided for each hour of training. He indicated that it had been determined that incentive pay would not be provided for additional training.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that the Volunteers had requested \$125,432 for administrative costs, while only \$47,460 was currently being requested. Mr. Pollack stated that the current administrative staff was being maintained at the same level of pay. He felt that rewards of serving were worth more than the pay. Chief Padden questioned if the budget being referred to included a full-time fire chief. He indicated that if that was the case, compensation and pension costs would increase.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Mayor Pro Tem Clark questioned how the auditor's expenses went from \$10,500 in previous years to nothing in the proposed budget. Commissioner Silverstone stated that the cost had been mitigated as the Volunteers were practicing due diligence. He explained that it would be difficult to exact a percentage to the cost, but he felt that the contingency in the budget would cover the costs. Mayor Pro Tem Clark emphasized the need to ensure that the Volunteers understood that independent audits would be required if they contracted with the Town.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that the proposed budget provided \$700 for workers' compensation; however, he felt that the cost would be no less than \$2,000. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers were using a different carrier, adding that the funding for physicals had also been cut.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that contractual services were shown to have no cost. Mr. Pollack stated the costs for determining the fire assessment were no longer being charged as a cost to the Volunteers. Mayor Parker questioned if the cost should be born by the Volunteers if they were to be the sole provider. Mayor Pro Tem Clark replied affirmatively.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that the costs for seminars and travel had been reduced from \$7,000 to \$2,400. He asked why there was such a large discrepancy. Mr. Pollack stated that since there were members that were now instructors, it was no longer necessary to send individuals to outside agencies for training.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark indicated that costs for communications had been reduced from \$7,000 to \$3,500 and asked how the costs had been reduced by half. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers had previously been researching different communications, but now believed that it was not necessary. He indicated, too, that radios had previously been included with land-based communications.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark addressed leasing costs for vehicles, stating that one option indicated that there would be no cost, with another option indicating that the cost would be \$65,610, with a third option providing a cost of \$196,830. He asked how the proposed cost for vehicles that would be needed could vary by so much. Mr. Pollack stated that the two vehicles that were currently at the Volunteers' disposal should last another ten years. He indicated that each budget would include approximately \$100,000 for the purpose of vehicle purchases. Mayor Pro Tem Clark asked what the \$131,220 requested in 2005 was allocated for and, was the expense covered under the BSO contract. Mr. Pollack stated that all the vehicles were paid for; however, the Volunteers had been instructed by the Fire Administrator that an aerial truck needed to be purchased.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked who provided the dispatch services. Mr. Pollack responded that BSO provided those services. Vice Mayor Yanni asked how the Volunteers would

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

address dispatch communications if they became the sole provider. Mr. Pollack felt that BSO had to continue providing dispatch services.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that equipment maintenance had also been reduced from \$12,000 to \$9,000 and asked for an explanation to the downfall. Mr. Pollack explained that there had been a distinction made to show that "equipment" was not attached to the trucks. He further explained that the remainder of the equipment was included in vehicle maintenance.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark referenced vehicle maintenance, stating that the proposed budget there had reduced from \$36,000 to \$12,000. Mr. Pollack stated that the maintenance average for the vehicles was \$2,500 each. He indicated that although the Fire Administrator had stated that more funds were needed as the vehicles became older, the Volunteers felt that as long as periodic maintenance was kept, the additional funds would not be needed.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark expressed concern that with the rise in fuel costs, the Volunteers had lowered their estimated costs in fuel from \$5,000 to \$3,500. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers did not drive the trucks very far, indicating that it did not appear that the additional funds were needed. With regards to the reduction in cost for radios, Mr. Pollack explained that their membership did not believe it was necessary to upgrade their existing radios.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark questioned the lowered allocation of funds for physicals. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers had, while under the Town, provided physicals for all its members. He indicated that although the Volunteers wanted to initiate this practice again, they had obtained a package price from an individual doctor. Mr. Pollack stated that with the offered package rate, the Volunteers would be paying approximately \$125 per physical as opposed to nearly \$300.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark referenced the allocated costs for miscellaneous operating equipment and supplies, noting a reduction from \$15,000 to \$7,500 in the current proposal. Mr. Pollack stated that with the new allocations, the costs for uniforms and other items now fell under capital purchases.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark indicated that the cost for office supplies had been reduced from \$4,000 to \$2,100. Mr. Pollack stated that the Volunteers tried to minimize a lot of paper and other things of that nature, averaging less funds being needed for these expenses.

Chief LeDuc stated that BSO was not providing a formal PowerPoint presentation, stating that the information provided within the handout was sufficient to make its point regarding the issues of concern that the Broward Sheriff's Office was asserting.

Chief LeDuc stated that the Broward Sheriff's Office respected the Volunteers and that BSO did not desire to "atrophy" the department as previously suggested by Chief

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Padden. He indicated that BSO had arduously worked to have a good relationship with the Volunteers; however, he emphasized that safety issues could not be ignored as they placed the Volunteers, BSO personnel and the community in general at risk. Chief LeDuc stated that BSO believed the Volunteers could provide an essential service, but again the safety concerns had to be addressed. He emphasized that compliance to the current contract had to be ensured.

Chief LeDuc stated the differences between the training of personnel within the Broward Sheriff's Office with that of the Volunteers. He stated that because of the staffing requirements, each of the Sheriff's equipment was able to ensure that at least one paramedic was upon every apparatus. Chief LeDuc explained the benefits of having the additional medical assistance in responding to calls that may require medical assistance. He explained that if fire suppression with the Sheriff's Office were eliminated, Engine 36 would be removed and the Town would lose 50 percent of its medical response capabilities.

Commissioner McIntee asked for clarification of whether Engine 36's primary function was medical calls. Chief LeDuc replied negatively, stating that its purpose was fire suppression; however, if a medical emergency arose at a scene, the crew had the capability, with the proper training and licensing to provide medical assistance.

Commissioner Silverstone stated that he understood the answer provided, but asked how many responses actually required that both Engine 36 and Rescue 12 respond. Chief LeDuc stated that this answer could be somewhat subjective, but offered to try to obtain that information. He further explained that this was often a decision made by the medical authority for the Broward Sheriff's Office, a medical physician who oversaw and provided direction for proper treatment.

Chief Lanza stated that it was important to note that in the event of two emergencies, one unit would respond to one call, with the second unit responding to the second call. He explained that in this type of instance, it was possible for both medical calls to receive advanced life support. Chief Lanza stated that this scenario happened within every fire system and that this was not the time to call for automatic aid. He explained that automatic aid was requested when both units were running calls and a third unit was requested for use as back up. Chief Lanza reminded the Commission that the Volunteers had not wanted to pursue the ability to provide paramedic assistance. Commissioner Silverstone emphasized that he had never stated that. Chief Lanza indicated that from discussions previously held, he had inferred that the Volunteers had not wanted to pursue this service provision. Commissioner Silverstone stated that the Volunteers were trained to be first responders by virtue of being firefighters. Chief Lanza emphasized the differences between being a first responder and having the proper training and certification to provide advanced life support. Commissioner Silverstone concurred.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Mayor Parker asked if Rescue 12 was a transport unit. Chief LeDuc replied affirmatively. Mayor Parker asked if Rescue 12 had the necessary equipment to fight fires. Chief LeDuc replied negatively, stating that although it was staffed with firefighter/paramedics who could assist at a fire scene, its primary responsibility was medical.

Mayor Parker asked if Engine 36 could be used for transporting. Chief LeDuc replied negatively, stating that the equipments' primary role was fire suppression. He explained, however, that it did have equipment to stabilize people and provide advanced life support until a transport unit arrived.

Mayor Parker asked if there were solid differences between an emergency medical technician (EMT) and a paramedic. Chief LeDuc replied that there was quite a difference in services, stating that EMTs could provide only basic assistance to stabilize an individual until medical assistance was available. He indicated that this assistance consisted of bleeding control, oxygen administration, and CPR. Chief LeDuc explained that paramedic was defined in the Florida Statutes to provide critical invasive medical procedures, under the direction of a medical physician, to administer drugs, surgical procedures, and a host of other life saving procedures.

Mayor Parker stated then that when it was asserted that the Volunteer membership had firefighter/EMTs, it was not the same level of service as firefighter/paramedic. Chief LeDuc concurred. Some discussion followed concerning the type of response needed for different emergency calls. Chief LeDuc stated that there were calls that, based on the severity, would have an additional paramedic taken from Engine 36 to ensure that proper attention could be provided to the patient while being transported to the hospital.

Commissioner Silverstone questioned what was the current staffing for the Broward Sheriff's Office within the Town. Chief LeDuc stated that as the Commission was aware, additional staffing had been recently provided until the problems encountered with the Volunteers could be corrected. He advised that the additional staff was being provided at no cost to the Town.

Mayor Parker expressed concern that if the Town used solely the Volunteers for fire suppression, its cost for emergency medical services would increase to ensure that proper medical assistance was provided to Town residents. Commissioner Silverstone stated that those services could be bid out. Chief Padden stated that Chief Frank Buchert had provided the higher calculations during the budget process and felt that the estimates provided had been "intentionally inflated" in an effort to show that there would be no cost savings to the Town in using the Volunteers. Mayor Parker stated that he was not trying to inflate the cost for using the Volunteers, but expressed concern that the cost savings would be eaten up with providing proper emergency medical services.

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

Commissioner Silverstone stated that prior to his being a Commissioner, a lot of false information had been provided. He indicated that this was the main reason he had run for this seat. Commissioner Silverstone stated that he had done a lot of research and that there were "a lot of hungry people out there" to provide services. He believed that American Medical Response (AMR) was the largest medical provider in the country and felt that this was a good alternative for the Town to pursue. Commissioner Silverstone stated that he had spoken with AMR representatives who were willing to contract with the Town for a cost of \$700,000.

Commissioner Silverstone stated that based on the information he had researched, a volunteer fire department could provide the necessary services to the Town. He stated that by evidence, the City of Plantation also used a volunteer fire department. Commissioner Silverstone acknowledged that the Volunteers might not have been capable in the past, but felt that was no longer the case. Commissioner Silverstone requested that Chief Lanza review the procedures for the Volunteers and provide a determination of whether the department complied with the requirements set forth in the Statutes for volunteer fire departments.

Commissioner McIntee stated that the requirement for responding to medical calls was only one paramedic. Chief Lanza stated that the Florida Statutes required one paramedic/EMT driver; however, he stated that in practice it was insufficient when dealing with complicated medical cases. He described various scenarios that would require more than one person who could provide medical assistance.

Commissioner McIntee asked the location of the closest ambulance run by the Broward Sheriff's Office outside of the Town's municipal boundaries. Chief LeDuc replied that the location was approximately eight miles away from Town. He emphasized, however, that this was the importance of ensuring that Engine 36 was capable and ready to assist in case of a medical emergency. Brief discussion followed concerning mutual aid response, with Chief LeDuc explaining that because of the set up of the system there was an inherent delay in responding under mutual aid. Commissioner McIntee stated that common sense indicated that since it was harder to obtain assistance through mutual aid, the Town should have emergency services provided by either the City of Fort Lauderdale or Pompano Beach. He indicated that if services from AMR were obtained, the contract would state that a second unit would automatically be dispatched. Chief Lanza stated that the mutual aid automatically offered by AMR would be charged to the Town. Commissioner McIntee disagreed.

Commissioner McIntee stated that the only reason a second emergency medical unit would be necessary was if the Town continued to do business with the Broward Sheriff's Office. He explained that due to their procedures where two staff members went into a fire scene, with two members waiting outside, it took the current second unit out of service. Commissioner McIntee explained that the Volunteers did not have this

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

problem. He stated that if there were a time when the Broward Sheriff's Office took over the City of Pompano Beach, then this resource would have to be reconsidered. Commissioner McIntee felt that Chief Lanza was "pre-judged" against the Volunteers. Chief Lanza emphasized that he had, as a fire and emergency medical services expert, been hired to prepare a request for proposal for the Town with regards to emergency medical services. He stated that his concern in preparing the proposal was solely the safety of the residents and visitors of the Town. Chief Lanza explained that he reviewed the Town's requirements based on his knowledge of the services, as well as his experience on how the system actually worked. He stated that the standards for Broward County, with the Town's call history, the Town would be short an engine and a ladder truck at each call within a multiple family unit. Chief Lanza stated that this would require many mutual aid calls which would, in fact, be very costly to the Town. Commissioner McIntee stated that this was only a recommendation and did not believe it was necessary to have that many units respond.

Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that some comments had been made that the proposed budget presented in 2005 had been inflated. He explained, however, that the two budgets he had used were below the actual amounts used. Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that he had used those budgets to compare with the presentation recently provided by the Volunteers.

Vice Mayor Yanni stated that he could not believe some of the comments made tonight. He emphasized that the Town was discussing public safety and Commissioner McIntee was referring to scenarios that might never happen. Vice Mayor Yanni referenced the use of AMR, asking if the company itself had been researched. Commissioner Silverstone replied that he had done basic research on the company. Vice Mayor Yanni questioned their capabilities and emphasized that the Town was currently enjoying the best possible service available to it for the benefit of its residents. He could not understand why the departments could not get together to work out their differences. Vice Mayor Yanni stated that the Commission had held one workshop after another, but the Commission still had to take the responsibility for making the choice and ensuring public safety. He asked that this item be placed on the agenda for action at the next regular meeting so that the Commission could move forward with the Town's business.

Commissioner Silverstone felt that this action was premature, stating that the use of AMR was only one option to consider. He felt that the Town needed to further review its options.

Vice Mayor Yanni asked Commissioner Silverstone if he had ever received complaints regarding the medical services provided by the Broward Sheriff's Office. Commissioner Silverstone replied negatively. He stated, however, that he had received complaints

Town Commission Workshop Meeting Minutes  
September 26, 2006

regarding the manner in which they reached a scene. Commissioner Silverstone stated that the emergency medical personnel were highly qualified and he had no objections to the services they provided. He felt that if the Commission wanted the Town to be safer, it should consider the hiring of additional law enforcement officers.

Commissioner Silverstone stated that the true question was a matter of risk versus the cost for services. He questioned if the Town had too much protection, stating that with his research he had found that the Town was over protected. Commissioner Silverstone indicated that combination departments could work and offered to look into hiring full time firefighters for the Volunteers. He felt that the Volunteers had had to work hard to make this system work, but they were dealing with two separate "cultures".

A recess was taken at 10:23 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 10:29 p.m.

Commissioner McIntee addressed Mayor Pro Tem Clark stating that he had given his word that "we" would hold as many workshops as needed. Mayor Pro Tem Clark indicated that he had no objections to holding additional workshop meetings.

Commissioner McIntee suggested that perhaps the meeting should be adjourned. Mayor Parker advised that Vice Mayor Yanni had requested that this item be placed on the agenda for the next regular meeting. He indicated that that business had to be addressed before adjournment.

After some discussion, the following item was discussed for placement on the agenda.

Special Business: Discussion and/or action regarding fire suppression, to include but not be limited to:

- 1) Going with Broward Sheriff's Office alone
- 2) Going with Volunteer Fire Department alone
- 3) Maintaining the status quo
- 4) Scheduling more workshops

Mayor Parker suggested that Chief Lanza be allowed to provide his recommendations at the next meeting as he had never been provided with the opportunity to do so.

Commissioner McIntee felt that additional workshop meetings should be held. Mayor Parker had no objections to additional workshop meetings, but stated that Vice Mayor Yanni had the right to request that the item be placed on the agenda at a regular meeting. Commissioner Silverstone agreed.

Commissioner McIntee stated that it was improper for the Commission to determine what action to take at this time, stating that if the Volunteers were not kept, the Town would not know how much it would cost for the Broward Sheriff's Office to provide the services. He felt that this was "spinning wheels and wasting time".

Commissioner Silverstone stated that if the Town decided to use only the services of the Broward Sheriff's Office, the cost for those services would increase. He asked Attorney Cherof if the Sheriff's Office could raise the cost to the Town. Attorney Cherof explained that the Town was locked in to its current contract. Commissioner Silverstone asked if the Town would have a double-taxation problem. Attorney Cherof did not believe that this would fall under double-taxation.

Commissioner McIntee expressed his belief that the Mayor wanted to eliminate the Volunteers. He stated that he was counting on Mayor Pro Tem Clark to stick to his word of agreeing to hold additional workshop meetings. Mayor Parker emphasized that he did not want to eliminate the Volunteers. Mayor Pro Tem Clark stated that he had no objections to additional workshop meetings, but stated that it was a Commission decision. He felt the Vice Mayor had the right to request that action be taken.

- D. Scheduling of any additional fire workshops that the Commission feels are necessary

This item was discussed earlier in the meeting.

#### **4. ADJOURNMENT**

Vice Mayor Yanni made a motion to adjourn the meeting. As there were no objections and no other business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 10:47 p.m.

---

Oliver Parker, Mayor

ATTEST:

---

Alina Medina, Town Clerk

Date Accepted: \_\_\_\_\_